



**SUBMISSION OF THE
AIR LINE PILOTS ASSOCIATION
TO THE
NATIONAL TRANSPORTATION SAFETY BOARD
REGARDING THE ACCIDENT INVOLVING
COMAIR FLIGHT 3272
AT MONROE, MICHIGAN
ON JANUARY 9, 1997**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
I. <u>COMAIR 3272 WEATHER ANALYSIS</u>	1
A. <u>THE EMB-120 ICING PIREP DEPARTING CINCINNATI</u>	1
B. <u>THE WEATHER CONDITIONS PRESENT</u>	2
C. <u>CMR 3272 AND NWA 272 FLIGHTPATH WRT LOW REFLECTIVITY AREA</u>	3
II. <u>AIRCRAFT PERFORMANCE</u>	7
A. <u>CMR 3272 FDR / FLIGHT PROFILE REVIEW</u>	8
B. <u>EMB-120 HANDLING QUALITIES</u>	8
1. Initial Dry-Air / High Angle-of-Attack Flight Testing	8
2. Stall Behavior – Design Considerations	10
C. <u>PREVIOUS EMB-120 ICE INDUCED ROLL UPSETS</u>	13
D. <u>EMBRAER FLIGHT SIMULATOR STUDY</u>	14
E. <u>WESTAIR 7233 INCIDENT</u>	16
III. <u>BFGOODRICH ANALYSIS / NASA LEWIS TESTING</u>	19
A. <u>BFGOODRICH ICE IMPINGEMENT STUDY</u>	20
B. <u>NASA LEWIS ICING RESEARCH TUNNEL TESTING</u>	20
C. <u>WEATHER CORRELATION / ICING ENVIRONMENT EXPOSURE</u>	22
IV. <u>ICING CERTIFICATION</u>	24
A. <u>U.S. AIRCRAFT CERTIFICATION</u>	24
B. <u>FOREIGN AIRCRAFT CERTIFICATION</u>	25
1. US – Brazil Bilateral Airworthiness Agreement	27

V.	<u>EMB-120 ICING ENCOUNTER VISUAL CUES</u>	29
A.	<u>VISUAL CUES</u>	29
VI.	<u>MANEUVERS VERSUS PROCEDURES</u>	32
A.	<u>MANEUVERS VERSUS PROCEDURES</u>	32
VII.	<u>AIRCRAFT OPERATIONS AND COMPANY GUIDANCE</u>	36
A.	<u>EMBRAER OPERATIONS BULLETIN 120-002/96 AND AFM REVISION 43</u>	36
B.	<u>FAA OVERSIGHT OF MANUAL CHANGES</u>	37
C.	<u>COMPANY DISSEMINATED PILOT INFORMATION</u>	38
VIII.	<u>EMB-120 AIRCRAFT AIRSPEED GUIDANCE</u>	40
A.	<u>REFERENCE SPEED GUIDANCE</u>	40
IX.	<u>TRAINING</u>	42
A.	<u>ICE INDUCED ROLL UPSET</u>	42
B.	<u>STALL TRAINING AND FAA REQUIREMENTS</u>	42
1.	Stall Training and Testing	43
2.	Impending Stall Identification	44
X.	<u>AIRCRAFT SYSTEMS</u>	45
A.	<u>EMB-120 AIRCRAFT AND INSTALLED SYSTEMS</u>	45
1.	Autopilot System	45
2.	Stall Warning System	47
3.	Pitch Trim System	48
4.	Ice Detection System	48

5.	De-ice/Anti-ice System (Ice/Rain Protection)	51
6.	A-56B Conductive Edge Sealer	52
7.	Recording Systems	52
8.	Fast/Slow Indicator	52
XI.	<u>AIR TRAFFIC CONTROL</u>	54
A.	<u>SEPARATION STANDARDS</u>	54
B.	<u>PIREP DISSEMINATION</u>	55
C.	<u>TURBOJET VS. TURBOPROP HANDLING</u>	55
XII.	<u>POWERPLANTS</u>	56
A.	<u>TORQUE DIFFERENTIAL</u>	56
B.	<u>POWER LEVER ANGLE (PLA) FDR PARAMETER</u>	57
XIII.	<u>HUMAN PERFORMANCE</u>	59
A.	<u>FLIGHTCREW PERFORMANCE ANALYSIS</u>	59
B.	<u>FLIGHTCREW PERFORMANCE / OBSERVATIONS</u>	60
XIV.	<u>CONCLUSIONS</u>	61
XV.	<u>RECOMMENDATIONS</u>	63